



Final Project Progress Report

Local Elections Project – Support to the Central Committee for Municipal Council Elections (CCMCE) to Conduct Local Elections in Libya

April 2018 to December 2022

PROJECT INFORMATION

<p>Project ID:</p> <p>Project Name:</p> <p>Project Duration:</p> <p>Total Project Budget:</p> <p>Implementing Partner(s):</p> <p>Project counterparts:</p>	<p>00110614 (under award ID 00111785)</p> <p>Local Elections Project – Support to the Central Committee for Municipal Council Elections (CCMCE) to conduct local elections in Libya</p> <p>April 2018 – December 2022</p> <p>USD 10,817,369</p> <p>United Nations Development Programme</p> <p>The primary implementation partner of the project was the CCMCE (later the CCLE) along with the Electoral Security Department of the MoI, the MoLG and the Training Centre for Decentralization Affairs (especially in 2022), the High Council of Judges, lawyers of the State Lawsuits Cases Department, the Supreme Council of Local Administration, civil society organizations, municipal councils, the NPC, and the Ministry of Youth for the next phase of the project. Project beneficiaries included elected councilors and municipal council administrators, staff and employees from the ministries, staff and Board members of the CCME/ CCLE, citizens, eligible voters, civil society organization representatives, journalists, and activists.</p>
<p>UNDP Country Programme Document (2019-2022) Outcomes to which LEP contributed:</p>	<p>Outcome 1: “The active participation of citizens in the democratic transition of their nation is facilitated”.</p>

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
ACRONYMS	6
PROJECT CONTEXT	7
PROJECT PROGRESS OVERVIEW	10
(i) Contributing factors	10
(ii) Inhibiting factors.....	10
(iii) Implementation issues	10
PROJECT RESULTS.....	11
(i) OUTPUT 1: Support to the planning and implementation of credible election operations including voter registration	11
(ii) OUTPUT 2: Facilitate democratic participation before and in between elections through voter and civic education / awareness raising activities.....	15
PROJECT PERFORMANCE	21
Capacity Development.....	22
Gender Mainstreaming.....	24
Human Rights Mainstreaming	25
Impact on direct and indirect beneficiaries	25
Communications and publicity	26
IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY REVIEW	27
(i) Sustainability	27
(ii) Participatory processes.....	27
(iii) Quality of partnerships.....	28
(iv) National ownership	28
(v) Monitoring and evaluation	29
(vi) Timely delivery of outputs	29
(vii) Cost-effective use of inputs	30
IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES	31
LESSONS LEARNED	34
RECOMMENDATIONS	34
FINANCIAL STATUS AND UTILIZATION	35
ANNEXES	36
ANNEX I: FINANCIAL SUMMARY	36
ANNEX II: LIST OF CSOs SUPPORTED THROUGH LOW-VALUE GRANTS (LVG)...	37
ANNEX III: LIST OF SUPPORTED MUNICIPAL COUNCIL ELECTIONS.....	39

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Local Elections Project (LEP) supported the organization of 43 municipal council elections in Libya with accepted results and contributed to the resumption of democratic processes after the conduct of the first-generation council elections between 2013 and 2016. The project contributed to strengthening local democracy and the capacities of national and local institutions. Specifically, the project developed the Libyan institutions' capacities, such as the Central Committee for Municipal Council Elections (CCMCE), later named as Central Committee for Local Elections (CCLE), the Ministry of Interior (MoI), the High Council of Judges, lawyers of the State Lawsuits Cases Department, newly elected municipal councilors and municipal administrators as well as civil society organisations. Overall, the project contributed to enhancing Libya's transitional governance structures and facilitated citizens' participation in democratic processes through support to the planning and implementation of credible election operations, including voter registration (Output 1), and support for the facilitation of democratic participation before and in between elections with civic and voter education activities and awareness raising activities (Output 2).

In this context, the project contributed to the United Nations Strategic Framework 2019-2022 (UNSF) outcome 1, as follows: "By late 2022, core government functions will be strengthened and Libyan institutions and civil society, at all levels, will be better able to respond to the needs of the people (Libyans, migrants, and refugees) through transparent, inclusive gender-sensitive decision-making processes abiding by the democratic principles of division of power and rule of law." The project contributed to sustainable development goals (SDG), specifically SDG 16 "the promotion of peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development and accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels," and to SDG 17, "strengthened means of implementation through capacity development." Moreover, the project contributed to the technical reunification of two government entities affected by the political division between the East and the West, namely the technical reunification of the Audit Bureau (AB) and the Administrative Control Authority (ACA).

Regarding the achievement of project results, much was accomplished concerning support for the planning and implementation of credible election operations (Output 1). The project faced numerous challenges in implementing its electoral assistance fully. That was mainly due to: (a) not all municipalities with expired mandates in Libya were able to participate in the electoral process; and (b) the ongoing political divisions obstructed the efforts of the CCMCE to organize elections in the East. Additionally, due to political, security, legal and institutional setbacks, elections were not organized regularly, and the electoral calendar changed several times during the project cycle.

The CCMCE organized, between 2013 and 2016, 92 first-generation municipal council elections across Libya. In 2018, the CCMCE conducted another 3 elections, thus, completing the first series of elections in 95 municipalities. New municipalities were created by both the Government of National Accord (GNA) and the Interim Government based in Tobruk, increasing the number to 116. However, in these 17 municipalities elections were not held. Moreover, new municipalities were created in 2021 by the Government of National Unity

(GNU), bringing the total number of municipalities, according to the Ministry of Local Government, to 143.

The LEP's objective was to support the CCMCE in conducting 95 second-generation council elections in those municipalities where first-generation elections were held until 2018 and in the newly established 17 municipalities (for first-generation elections). The project managed to support 44 electoral processes out of the 116. Hence, the project met its objective on second-generation council elections by 46%.

Concerning the facilitation of democratic participation before and in between elections (Output 2), much was achieved despite the challenges encountered. Several civic and voter education activities were conducted in partnership with civil society organizations contributing to the efforts of the CCMCE to enhance citizen awareness of local elections and increase participation in local elections. The intended increase in voter turnout on election day was not met, even though voter registration rates had grown in some municipalities.

In late 2018, the project added the component of 'Municipal Council Support' (MCS), initially called the 'Post-Election-Initiative,' to enhance the capacities of newly elected municipal councils. The pilot initiative was later developed with four capacity development modules dispensed to municipal councilors and core administrative staff. Direct engagement with elected councilors contributed to their capacities advancement and empowered them to address critical issues related to local governance. Additionally, a regular interface between newly elected municipal councils and the MoLG was created, enhancing direct communication between central and local government representatives.

Furthermore, in 2021, the project enlarged its range of support by including the 'Municipal Dialogue' component that consisted of a series of consultations with mayors across Libya as a follow-up to the municipal sub-track informing the Libyan Political Dialogue Forum (LPDF). This intervention enriched the discussions of the intra-Libyan political dialogue and highlighted the need to advance decentralization in Libya.

Lastly, in late 2021 and throughout 2022, the project added the component of 'Reunification of Libyan Institutions' and formed a new partnership with the National Planning Council (NPC) to help broker technical reunification through high-level discussions for government institutions affected by the political split between the East and the West.

ACRONYMS

AB	Audit Bureau
ACA	Administrative Control Authority
CCLE	Central Committee for Local Elections
CCMCE	Central Committee for Municipal Council Elections
CSOs	Civil Society Organizations
CVE	Civic and Voter Education
GNA	Government of National Accord
GNS	Government of National Stability
GNU	Government of National Unity
HNEC	High National Elections Commission
HoR	House of Representatives
LEP	Local Elections Project
LNA	Libyan National Army
LPDF	Libyan Political Dialogue Forum
MCS	Municipal Council Support
MoI	Ministry of Interior
MoLG	Ministry of Local Government
NPC	National Planning Council
PEI	Post-Election Initiative
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNSDCF	United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework 2023-2025
UNSF	United Nations Strategic Framework 2019-2022
USIP	United Nations Institute for Peace
UNSMIL	United Nations Support Mission in Libya
YMC	Youth Municipal Council

PROJECT CONTEXT

The LEP was established in April 2018 by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) in Libya, following the request of the CCMCE to the United Nations Support Mission in Libya (UNSMIL). The project was mandated to support the organization of peaceful, inclusive and credible municipal council elections and facilitate democratic participation in between and during elections¹. The project was initially led by UNSMIL's Chief Electoral Advisor, as part of the integrated United Nations Electoral Support Team until July 2019, when the Chief Electoral Advisor transitioned to UNDP as Chief Technical Advisor.

The project's theory of change was based on the assumption that electoral assistance to municipal council elections would contribute to establishing accountable and legitimate local governance institutions and improving democratic processes in Libya. As a result, it was projected to have a positive impact on the acceleration of the transition to democratic governance in the country.

The operating context of the project witnessed several changes during its lifecycle. Specifically, from April 2018 to April 2019, the Libyan political context was marked by ongoing political strife between the east and the west. In April 2019, forces of the self-proclaimed Libyan National Army (LNA) launched an offensive on Tripoli, which escalated LNA's hostilities with the Government of National Accord (GNA). Despite these challenges in the capital and southern Libya with the *de facto* occupation of the latter by the LNA, the CCMCE was able to organize 22 local elections from March to April 2019 in the South.

Another significant development with impact on the project context included the changes in the electoral legal framework. In October 2018, the GNA issued a new regulation (No.1363/2018) replacing regulation No.161/2013. The regulation introduced a switch from the single non-transferrable vote system to the party-block vote system with one list. As there were no prior consultations, many stakeholders raised concerns over the new approach, specifically regarding the seat reserved for women and PWDs from revolutionaries. Following this change, LEP held a stakeholder workshop to review the regulation in regard to local elections. As a result, the CCMCE was empowered to make amendments to the regulation, approved by government in 2019 (No.18/2019).

After the 22 second-generation council elections were conducted between March and April 2019 by the CCMCE, civil society organizations challenged the regulation in the Administrative Court of Tripoli. The court ruled the regulation to be contradictory to the Law No.59 of 2012². Another amendment was prepared by the CCMCE in collaboration with the MoLG. This amendment became the basis for the new regulation (No.06/2020), maintaining the electoral system of the party-block vote and adjusting the security requirements in polling centers. From June 2019 until March 2020 (when regulation No.06 was issued), all electoral

¹ The CCMCE conducted 92 first-generation local elections between 2013-2016, with an additional three elections conducted in April 2018 bringing the total of elections held to 95.

² Law 59/2012 is the legal basis for all aspects of roles and functions of municipal councils, including the elections.

operations were put on hold due to the suspension of the legal framework and the lack of electoral budget. The electoral regulations underwent one more significant change in September 2022. The regulation No.387 abolished individual lists for 2 reserved seats for women and PWDs from revolutionaries and integrated them into the party block lists.

These changes in electoral regulations put the credibility of the conducted elections and the CCMCE's reputation at risk. They also exposed the electoral committee to legal challenges that shifted the resources, including Financial resources, from operations to legal defense. The GNA and the GNU did not engage in systemic stakeholder discussions to resolve the differences.

Other challenges to the CCMCE's activities included the global COVID-19 pandemic and the continuous internal changes. The outbreak of COVID-19 in March 2020 further postponed the resumption of local elections until August 2020. Nevertheless, before the end of the year, the CCMCE was able to adjust its procedures and organize 9 elections, followed by another 8 in 2021 (including two re-runs). Additionally, the middle of 2021 brought on the resignation of CCMCE's Chairperson. The new position holder was appointed in October 2021, followed by the reshuffle of the CCMCE's board, including the exclusion of the only female Board Member and the LEP's focal point. These developments destabilized the CCMCE, limiting its implementation and coordination capacities.

The political context marked by the ongoing division between the east and the west also negatively impacted the overall context of local elections. For instance, the Tobruq-based interim government appointed an electoral committee for Eastern Libya in July 2019 as a response to rival 'Tripoli-based' CCMCE. This decision went against the statement of the HoR requiring the CCMCE to run elections across the country. The Eastern electoral committee was able to organize only 3 elections in Jkherra, Jalou and Owjla, with the local population partially contesting them. In February 2022, the Government of National Stability (GNS) was formed with the backing of the House of Representatives (HoR), deepening the political division in the country. In June 2022, the GNS established the Central Committee for Municipal Council Elections in Benghazi and issued an electoral regulation for local elections to be conducted in Eastern Libya, in December 2022.

After the formation of the GNU, the Tripoli-based CCMCE was made the single electoral management body responsible for municipal council elections in Libya. There was pressure from the Eastern CCMCE sub-committees to swiftly organize second-generation council elections in the east as well as in the rest of Libya. Although the decentralization process achieved significant progress with competencies transferred from the national to the local level, the GNU did not focus on local democratic processes. As the east-west confrontation resumed in 2022, a parallel Eastern Elections Committee was established, with discussions on cooperation between Benghazi and Tripoli CCMCEs initiated but not concluded. The LEP, together with the NPC, addressed this divide through the technical reunification activity focusing on the institutions open to cooperation and not being part of the eastern or western executives. The facilitation of the technical reunification proved successful, especially for the

east and west branches of the Audit Bureau, with the Administrative Control Authority lagging behind with one signature.

The LEP's context was marked by many changes and challenges of political, security, legal and institutional nature, spanning beyond control and consuming significant resources. In order to continue delivering value to the Libyan people, the project repositioned itself and continuously adapted, from temporarily relocating staff to Tunisia due to intensified fighting to allocating resources to address formerly unforeseen setbacks.

PROJECT PROGRESS OVERVIEW

(i) Contributing factors

Despite a highly complex operating environment, the project achieved significant results. The main factors which contributed to project achievements were the provision of high quality advisory services on electoral operations and technical assistance to the CCMCE (later CCLE) at the Board level; the set-up of a versatile project team composed mainly of national advisors and some international staff which effectively supported all project activities; the collocation of the project team at the CCMCE/CCLE headquarters that enhanced cooperation between the teams; close coordination with CCMCE/CCLE at the senior management level, namely with the chairpersons and the Board Members; continuous support for the institutional development of the CCMCE/CCLE; development of partnerships with national stakeholders having a significant role in electoral processes; advocacy on the importance of local elections and the role of municipal councils in making the transition towards functional democratic institutions at the local level; the contributions and support from international partners for project continuity; proactive and continuous reporting on local elections and related developments; close communication and cooperation with UNSMIL and other international electoral partners; and a steady commitment from project donors to the local elections process in Libya.

(ii) Inhibiting factors

The main factors inhibiting project progress were the lack of government support for local elections and, consequently, the lack of a nationwide outreach and sensitization campaign for citizens to participate in local elections; the instability of the legal framework and electoral laws for municipal council elections; changes in the electoral regulation without prior stakeholder consultations; changes in the administration of the CCMCE and thereafter, in the collaborative framework between the project and the CCLE after October 2021; a persisting political split in Libya and the standoff on the organization of national elections with repercussions on the legitimacy of the legislature and the executive; the instrumentalization of council elections in political antagonisms; and the overall fragility of the security situation in Libya.

(iii) Implementation issues

The fundamental implementation issues for the project were external such as the legal, political, security, public health, and institutional challenges. The internal implementation issues included the limited administrative capacity of the project to have a steady and uninterrupted pace for the implementation of planned activities and timely delivery of results; an irregular involvement and interest in joint planning exercises from the national counterparts due to lack of human resources and limited capacities; the limited administrative capacity of the project to meet administrative and other corporate requirements; a loose connection between project results at the output level and results at the outcome level generating and/or contributing to development outcomes; implementation challenges resulting from changes of CCMCE/CCLE decisions, often at the last minute; insufficient time and resources from both the project and the committee to work on a joint planning process with sufficient monitoring.

PROJECT RESULTS

(i) OUTPUT 1: Support to the planning and implementation of credible election operations including voter registration

Regarding the LEP's Output 1, the project has partially delivered on Activity 1.1., aimed at the provision of technical advice and support to voter registration, along with facilitation of the overall voter registration update. The delivery was at 50%, with 44 elections supported by the project. In addition, the CCMCE's (later CCLE) Information Technology department in control of the data centre was continuously assisted by the project from 2019 onwards. The project upgraded the voter registration system in collaboration with International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES), including the upgradation of the data centre's infrastructure through procurement and delivery of up-to-date equipment and software. These activities supported progress on the CCMCE's priority area on electronic voter registration.

Activity 1.2. addressed the procurement and deployment of international and local standard election materials, with the project delivering 100% of its intended results with no significant delay. For this, the project covered the acquisition and dispatch of electoral materials through various shipment options, Petro Air and Libya Post.

Activity 1.3. covered the operational support to the overall planning and implementation, along with sub-activities. In this, the project refurbished the CCMCE headquarters at the HNEC to facilitate the Committee's operational capacity. However, the security equipment was not part of the allocated budget, and additional work on infrastructure was required. The project addressed this through collaborating with the UN Department of Safety and Security and conducted a joint security assessment of the CCMCE premises to fully prepare the Committee for relocation, with government funding for implementing security measures.





*Rehabilitation works at the CCMCE offices and the handover of premises in October 2020.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

Sub-activity 1.3.2. was aimed at supporting the protected storage and deploying the polling materials, and the LEP achieved its intended results. The project provided technical advice on the management of protected storage and archiving solutions with standard protocols, also ensuring the deployment of polling materials to the CCMCE (later transferred to CCLE). However, three storage facilities of the CCMCE required refurbishments which exceeded the budget and were not included in the support activity.

Sub-activity 1.3.3. covered the planning and implementation of cascade training for polling and was delivered at 100% through the provision of technical support by the project-funded Training and Procedures National Advisor with the CCMCE. The Advisor assisted in all training activities reaching electoral staff and sub-committee training, from 2019 until project closure.

Sub-activity 1.3.4. provided for the advisory services and support on the essential operational stages of the electoral process, with the LEP providing continuous advice to the CCMCE/CCLE throughout its lifecycle. That was achieved through national and international advisors covering the full spectrum of electoral operations and dispensing technical advice on operational matters in addition to the guidance of the Chief Technical Advisor.

Sub-activity 1.3.5. was concerned with training sessions, workshops, seminars, lessons learned and consultations on electoral systems for council elections. The project sponsored numerous workshops and seminars since 2018, and organised two lessons learned workshops for the

CCMCE and international partners in 2019 and 2021, two internal review meetings with the CCMCE and the project team in 2019 and 2020, and one retreat for the CCLE Board to review its strategy and mission. In addition, the project funded a study tour to the UNDP/EU Global Conference on ‘Sustaining Peace for Elections’ in 2018 and facilitated the participation of 15 CCMCE staff in the Tunisian presidential and parliamentary elections of 2019 as guest observers of the Tunisian Independent High Authority for Elections (ISIE). The CCMCE established a good relationship with the ISIE in 2018 by signing a Memorandum of Understanding. In 2021, the project organized three webinars for the CCMCE’s Legal Unit on comparative experiences for the electoral system, the legal framework, and best democratic practices with experts from the ISIE.

The project provided systematic advisory services to the CCMCE/CCLE units and added a coordination tool in 2021 with the set-up of task forces between the Committee and the project. This ensured regular and up-to-date exchange of information, coordination, and problem-solving. In total, the LEP held more than 200 task force weekly meetings on elections and technology, electoral security and conflict prevention, legal affairs, civic and voter education and outreach, and operations.

Sub-activity 1.3.6. supported the preparation for and implementation of the election day, with the LEP funding the CCMCE operations room outside of its HQ during the 2020 elections. National Project Advisors supported the CCMCE staff on election day through assistance in results compilation, electoral observation, media monitoring and polling procedures. On this sub-activity, the delivery was at 100%.

Sub-activity 1.3.7. referred to electoral security and conflict prevention in municipalities, with the LEP reaching its intended results. In late 2018, the project recruited a national Field Coordinator and Conflict Prevention Advisor who conducted field visits and several preparatory consultations with stakeholders such as tribal, social, and community leaders in several municipalities (in Regdaleen, Sabha, and Sabrata in 2019 for conflict prevention related to tribal differences; in Misrata in 2019/2020 for mediation related to pre-electoral preparations; in Al Khoms in 2020/2021 for pre-electoral preparations; in Sirt and Ghat in 2020, in Ajdabiya in 2021, and partially in Juffra in 2021 for mediation related to tribal and political conflicts). In Sabha, the project organized a large stakeholder meeting in March 2020 to defuse tensions resulting from the controversy of the election results, which had led to the refusal of the former mayor to hand over to the newly elected municipal council. Another stakeholder workshop was organized in Misrata³ in February 2020 to prepare the ground for peaceful elections by engaging key stakeholders in discussions on municipal council elections.

Furthermore, in March 2019, the LEP collaborated with *Creative International* on the organization of a training on electoral violence and conflict prevention for 28 CCMCE sub-committee staff and MoI officers (25 men and 3 women). In December of the same year, the

³ The municipality of Misrata was one of the municipalities where elections in April were suspended due to the outbreak of hostilities in April 2019. Due to the considerable military involvement of Misrati fighters in the conflict, many local NGOs and community leaders rejected the idea of holding council elections despite the mandate expiry of the council.

team followed up with another training session, introducing the risk assessment angle into the training for 40 CCMCE staff members (35 men and 5 women). The series of workshops was concluded by another one for 37 CCMCE staff (33 men and 4 women), held right before the pandemic. In 2020, the project elaborated its conflict prevention approach to assist the CCMCE in the preparation for elections and in dealing with post-conflict tensions that had evolved since April 2019. However, COVID-19 limited the range of activities during 2020.

In 2021, following one of the recommendations of the CCMCE's Lessons Learned workshop, the LEP dedicated additional resources to expand and deepen its work on electoral security and conflict prevention. A short-term international conflict prevention advisor was recruited for technical assistance and capacity support to the CCMCE, along with support for conflict prevention activities, including the establishment of a systematic approach to conflict assessment and prioritization of mediation. In this respect, two expert roundtable sessions were conducted for pre-election conflict analysis in 17 municipalities (assessed as high-risk with potential for electoral violence) to lay the foundations for peaceful and inclusive local elections. In June 2021, the project organized a large workshop on Libyan electoral security, with the participation of the MoI and international electoral assistance providers. The positive feedback from this workshop allowed the LEP to accelerate its support by recruiting a national Advisor who served as the focal point with the MOI's Electoral Security Directorate. As a result, four workshops on electoral security and planning were organised in 2022 for 132 security officers (107 men and 15 women) of the Eastern and Western branches of the Electoral Security Directorates of the MoI, including police officers.



*Group discussion during the electoral security workshop of June 2021.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*



*The first and second trainings of Western & Southern regional Electoral Security Directorates of the MoI in Tripoli, September & October 2022.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

Activities 1.4.1 – 1.4.3., addressing the capacity building for the CCMCE, were not implemented in full. The project delivered online capacity building training for the CCLE Board and staff in 2022, in collaboration with the UN Institute for Training and Research. This activity replaced the BRIDGE training sessions/workshops foreseen in the annual work plan as a sub-activity (1.4.2.) as a solution with a more comprehensive syllabus. However, the CCLE participants hardly attended online training and limited results were achieved. Concerning the sub-regional conference on local elections (sub-activity 1.4.3.), the activity was not implemented due to time and resource constraints, as the project team was engaged in the other activities under Output 2.

(ii) OUTPUT 2: Facilitate democratic participation before and in between elections through voter and civic education / awareness raising activities

Concerning the project's Output 2 on the facilitating of the development of CCLE's civic and voter education strategy, all planned sub-activities (2.1.1 to 2.1.3) were implemented. The project team delivered a design and disseminated voter awareness materials, provided advisory services on civic and voter education and awareness to the CCLE awareness unit, and created content to support the municipal council team. The project employed two national advisors who coordinated with the CCMCE/CCLE awareness unit to help a graphic designer and content creator (for radio spots and video clips).

The LEP's civic and voter education (CVE) team conducted the following activities:

- 24 face-to-face sessions;
- 15 workshops;
- Advocacy training sessions;
- One drawing and design campaign;
- One creative producer's workshop;
- One workshop for people with disabilities; and,
- One workshop on women's electoral strategy.



*Raising awareness on local elections seminar in Ajdabia, December 2022.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

Moreover, the team produced:

- More than 213 social media designs (posters, memes, comics, infographics)
- More than 59 radio products (radio spots, radio episodes, audio tracks, radio interviews, live discussions) and 7 podcasts
- More than 49 videos (videography, animation, interviews)
- 12 articles (inspirational press stories of local personalities participating in local elections) and 12 motivational stories about change through photography
- 60 characters and background designs
- Design and printing of 10.000 Ramadan calendars (*Imsakya* distributed to municipalities in East Libya)
- One booklet for municipal councils on using Facebook.



Awareness posters by Fonoon Institute. Credit: ©UNDP Libya.

The CVE team had a cross-cutting role across project components and directly supported the CCMCE's civic and voter education and communication strategy. One example is the CVE team administering the CCMCE Facebook page in 2019/2020, with an increase in the number of likes from 37,000 to over 130,000. In 2019, it also assisted the CCMCE with six trainings for sub-committees (covering 30 municipalities) on how to run awareness campaigns. The CVE team assisted the MCS team by providing 10 training workshops on communication to more than 42 municipalities and three trainings on content creation for 15 municipalities. The participants created more than 15 videos. In late 2022, the CVE team started to work with the MoLG's Media office on the production of one awareness video and on the visual identities of municipal councils, which was partially completed.

Sub-activities 2.2.1. – 2.2.3., regarding engagement with the civil society organizations (CSOs) and other electoral stakeholders aimed at promoting peaceful and inclusive electoral process, were fully implemented by the project. CSOs were awarded low value grants through four calls for proposals launched by the project in 2019, 2020, 2021 and 2022. The selected organisations implemented awareness campaigns covering 53 municipalities across Libya, with more than 350 products and more than 40 events organized. CSOs implemented activities targeted at women's and youth participation in local elections.



Awareness posters by Women's Forum for Development. Credit: ©UNDP Libya.

Concerning inclusive civic engagement platforms and sensitization of key stakeholders for active civic participation, the project worked with municipal councils on capacity building training sessions as early as 2019 and continued in 2021, after a pause during the pandemic. The project implemented 28 capacity building training workshops in 2022. It launched a pilot initiative in the form of a civic engagement platform for youth known as the 'Youth Municipal Council' which collaborated with two municipalities of Greater Tripoli.



*Youth Municipal Council session, October 2022.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

The project implemented sub-activities 2.3.1. – 2.3.7 (out of eight planned) and addressed post-election capacity building of municipal councils to inclusively represent and promote peace, stability and decentralization. Support to newly elected municipal councils through capacity-building workshops commenced in 2018 and was intensified during 2021 and 2022, with a partial break during the COVID-19. As a consequence of the pandemic, in-person training activities were suspended, and instead, online training sessions were organized. In-person activities gradually resumed towards the end of 2020.

Overall, the project developed four capacity-building modules with more than 40 municipal councils trained, with the substantial majority attending all workshops offered. Specifically, in 2019, during the pilot phase of the Post-Election Initiative, eight municipalities attended three module 1 workshops (induction with the MoLG, international and national local governance partners, and UNDP projects) and two module 2 trainings on communication and public outreach. In total, 81 councilors attended the 2 modules, of which 74 were men and 7 were women. In 2020, 18 municipalities attended two module 1 induction workshops, and 15 municipalities were trained on communication and public outreach with two module 2 trainings (one held online). In total, 147 councillors attended modules 1 and 2, of which 139 were men and 8 were women. In 2021, 16 municipalities attended four module 1 workshops, and 13

council members attended three module 2 trainings on communication and public outreach. In addition, two module 4 training sessions were organized for women councilors on the legal framework for local elections, Law No.59, and decentralization. Module 4 was facilitated by UNWomen and was conducted online due to the pandemic, with 33 women councilors in attendance until August 2021. Moreover, two focus groups were held with women councilors, former councilors, and members of parliament who discussed the new regulation. In total, 156 councilors participated in the activities of 2020, of which 104 were men and 52 were women. In 2022, the project organized three module 3 workshops on content creation (Module 3A) for 14 municipalities and three module 3 workshops on community participation (Module 3B) for 24 council members. Additionally, the project facilitated the participation of 23 municipal council members in the ‘Megara Climate Change Conference’ held in Tunis and supported three community participation sessions in Yefren, Owjla, and Tajoura. In total, 170 councilors attended the workshops of 2022, of which 125 were men and 45 were women.

The active youth involvement in the work of municipal councils was achieved through the ‘Youth Municipal Council’ (YMC) initiative conducted in 2022, as a pilot initiative. This initiative was designed to introduce a group of youth (composed of 7 men and 8 women) to the municipal councils’ work and promote interest in municipal affairs and, ultimately, in local elections.



*Youth Municipal Council session, November 2022.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

Support to municipalities to establish consultative processes and fora was provided through several community participation sessions. The number of municipalities supported to organize community participation sessions did not match the number of municipalities trained with capacity building workshops on the same subject, as the project did not have adequate resources to cover most of the newly elected municipal councils with facilitation.

The sub-activity on supporting the establishment of peacebuilding community-level platforms to enhance social cohesion and reconciliation was not undertaken. The municipality level was not sufficiently ready, and the initiative partially exceeded the capacities of the project. The establishment of mechanisms to mitigate post-electoral conflicts while incorporating peacebuilding elements into institutional development was partially materialized, as there was reluctance from the CCMCE to engage with the project in the conflict prevention approach. Also, no post-electoral conflict erupted in municipalities where elections had been held, so no mitigation mechanisms were required. However, short-term conflict prevention sessions were conducted in Regdaleen and Sabha in 2019, Khoms and Surman, Ajdabia, and Al Marj in 2021 and 2022.

For the provision of support to the MoLG for the design and implementation of the decentralization policy, the project elaborated a project document for the new Local Governance Project in consultation with the MoLG. Agreement on the Ministry's priorities and the way forward was reached, and the final approval for the new project is expected in early 2023 after the operational closure of the LEP.

Regarding support to municipal councils with little to no international support, specifically for training sessions and workshops, the project worked with some municipalities and followed the 'Leave No Municipality Behind' approach. These municipalities benefitted from taking part in the module on community participation.

The sub-activity on support to the NPC for reunification of Libyan institutions was integrated in the annual work plan for 2022, with the project achieving significant results for the year. Comprehensive support was provided to the NPC for the technical reunification of the AB and the ACA, with both branches from the East and the West taking part in the high-level technical discussions held in 2022. These resulted in two technical reunification roadmaps, signed by both branches of the Audit Bureau, while the final agreement for the Administrative Control Authority pending one signature.



*Left: Signing of the Audit Bureau's Reunification Roadmap
 Right: Signing of the Administrative Control Authority's Reunification Roadmap, December 2022.
 Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

Sub-activity 2.3.8. involving the dedicated experts on civic and voter education, conflict prevention and electoral security, municipal council support, and local governance provided advisory services throughout the project. Support was increased in 2022, with the senior-level local governance international consultant recruitment to strengthen support to municipal councils and local governance.

PROJECT PERFORMANCE

Project performance was not linear during the project cycle but witnessed periods of low, medium and high intensity of activities in the different areas of electoral support. Consequently, external and internal factors halted, delayed and/or propelled project performance in relation to implementation of activities.

As an example, with respect to UNSF Outcome 1 on strengthened core government functions by late 2020, the target of renewing the mandate of 38 municipalities was not achieved until the end of the year. After supporting the CCMCE in conducting 22 elections in 2019, the suspension of the legal framework and the outbreak of COVID-19 halted electoral operations and slowed down project performance. Only in the second semester of the year the project picked-up the pace with the decision of the Committee to resume operations. Based on advice

from LEP, the CCMCE adopted the option of using the UV ink spray instead of the traditional indelible ink and adjusted the polling day procedures with the addition of precautionary measures. The support provided by the project was essential and helped the CCMCE resume elections with nine more processes conducted in 2020.

After the resignation of the CCMCE Chairperson and until the appointment of the new Board in October 2021, elections did not take place until October 2022, and the regulation changed again in June 2022. As a result, the project did not record any progress in the number of electoral processes supported during this period, and the results were low. Given the above context, the project focused on the institutional development of the CCLE to strengthen the capacities of new Board members. The project remained close to the CCLE throughout this period, providing support on operations and advice on the sequencing of operations and the legal deadlines.

In the second half of 2022, the project surged its performance and organized more than 25 activities, including capacity-building events for the CCLE and other stakeholders. The project organized two workshops for lawyers from the State's Lawsuits Cases Department on the legal framework and electoral dispute resolution mechanism; and three workshops for judges on the electoral process and regulation for council elections. In the same vein, the project organized four workshops on electoral security and best practices, and training sessions for trainers for field officers of the MoI and police agents. Another three capacity-building activities were organized for the CCLE on elections, technology and best practices, the operational plan for elections, and training for CCLE sub-committees on the delivery and dispatch of electoral materials. In this way, during a period marked by the absence of elections, the project utilized its resources to strengthen the institutional capacities and other stakeholders with a significant role in local council elections.



*Third training of judges, November 2022.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

Capacity Development

The project contributed to building national capacities throughout its lifecycle. Primarily, the project focused on the institutional capacity-building of the CCMCE (later CCLE) as its primary counterpart and beneficiary. To this end, the project provided continuous advisory services on operational and technical aspects of the electoral process and advice on best practices for elections. After the appointment of the new CCLE Board in late 2021, the project focused on the capacity building of the Board members with little or no experience in elections to enhance the planning capacity of the Committee. In 2021 and 2022, the project exerted additional efforts to build the capacities of stakeholders with a significant role in elections.



*Working session during the CCLE Board workshop, 12-15 January 2022.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

As a result of the ‘Lessons Learned workshop’ held in March 2021, the project identified electoral security and dispute resolution capacities that needed strengthening in the interest of improving the electoral process in a holistic manner. This reasoning was also backed by the fact that two elections held in early 2021 in the municipalities of Hay Al Andalous⁴ and Tajoura were both cancelled by court decisions due to irregularities observed in a few polling centers. The rulings were out of proportion as the cancellation of the entire electoral process put in jeopardy the institutional reputation of the CCMCE. At that point, it became obvious that judges

⁴ The election in Hay Al Andalous was cancelled by the First Instance Court then, reinstated by the court’s second decision, and ultimately annulled by the Administrative Court. The election in Tajoura was annulled, then appealed and reinstated.

were insufficiently exposed to electoral dispute resolution mechanisms and were not well versed in the electoral process as such. The training was also beneficial to the judiciary for the preparation of national elections.

The project also contributed to strengthening national capacities in establishing and managing legislative frameworks for local elections. As the legislative framework is regulated at the central authority level, there was little to no consultation with the CCMCE/CCLE and other stakeholders on the electoral system to be applied. The electoral regulations were systematically issued by the government without stakeholder consultations. During the project cycle, the regulations governing local elections were changed three times. In 2018, after the regulation issuance no. 1363/2018, without prior stakeholder consultations, the project proposed to the CCMCE to organize a large stakeholder forum (160 people attended) to discuss the changes and make necessary reviews. As a result of the roundtable discussion, several recommendations were made and sent to the GNA, resulting in changes to the regulation. In addition, the project provided legal electoral advice to the CCMCE as part of its electoral assistance activities through a dedicated legal expert in 2021. The first draft of a consolidated electoral law for local elections was produced by the project at the end of 2022 as a basis for discussions within the framework of the new Local Governance Project, specifically, Output 1 on supporting government efforts on decentralization at the policy level.

In addition, the project provided on-the-job mentoring through the collocation of national project advisors at the CCMCE/CCLE offices. Interaction with CCMCE/CCLE counterparts was daily in different support areas, such as civic and voter education, training and procedures, logistics and procurement, operations, election observation, IT, communication, and legal affairs. This collaboration was further strengthened in 2021, following the creation of task forces as a result of the second ‘Lessons Learned workshop’ held with the CCMCE.

Gender Mainstreaming

Since the beginning, the project integrated gender-specific activities and affirmative actions into the annual work plan. Gender equality interventions targeted women, who are traditionally underrepresented⁵, for their effective participation in local elections. In addition, the project advocated continuously on gender mainstreaming through its policy advisory to the CCMCE (later CCLE), as well as to other stakeholders, mainly CSOs. Advocacy for voter inclusivity of both genders in electoral processes was highlighted throughout the project lifecycle as one of the cornerstones enhancing the credibility of the electoral process and electoral management bodies.

The project implemented activities targeting women through its civic and voter education component. Specifically, outreach and sensitization products on women’s participation in local elections were developed and used by the CCMCE/CCLE. Women were also targeted by CSO activities. These CSOs implemented several specific awareness raising activities for women

⁵ The regulation governing local elections and those that ensued after 2020 apply the party-block vote system, which is generally perceived as an electoral system reserving only one seat for women in municipal councils. However, women candidates can run in the party-block list, and there is no limitation to the number of women candidates who can run in the general list.

through workshops, field sensitization, and live discussions. In 2020 and 2021, the project organized two focus group discussions that examined barriers to women's participation in local elections, given the newly introduced new regulation at that time. Another affirmative action carried out by the project's Municipal Council Support team in 2021 was the development of a specific training module (Module 4) for women municipal councilors, which was developed in collaboration with UN Women. Based on this module, 33 women councilors were trained on Law 59 and decentralization.

Human Rights Mainstreaming

The LEP adopted a human-rights-based approach in all activities, ensuring compliance with UNDP policies and guidelines regulating environmental, social, health, and safety issues while applying non-discrimination and impartiality throughout its interventions and activities. Regarding support for local elections and the CCMCE/CCLC, the team regularly referred to existing policy papers of the UN Electoral Assistance Division regarding different subjects of electoral support. Activity planning was done in a conflict-sensitive manner, specifically for the electoral security and conflict prevention project component. The project ensured that institutional stakeholders were broadly represented in project activities, namely, by including stakeholders from the East and the West of Libya in several trainings and workshops.

The project worked with municipal councils with little or no international support, thus, transposing the approach of leaving no one behind to leaving no municipality behind to ensure equal support to municipal councils to the greatest extent possible. The project referred two cases of harassment of two women candidates to UNSMIL's human rights office before the municipal council elections of Sabratha and one case of prolonged incarceration without prosecution of one of CCMCE's officers (the head of Qasr Al Akhiar sub-committee). The project facilitated UNSMIL's mediation, and the cases were settled by providing the mission's good offices.

Impact on direct and indirect beneficiaries

The direct beneficiaries of the LEP were the electoral committee (CCMCE/CCLC), municipal councilors, state lawyers and judges, as well as representatives and officers of the MoI and police officers, who expressed satisfaction with respect to project trainings and workshops. Post-evaluation questionnaires on trainings and workshops rated project activities as being very useful and beneficial, and participants expressed their willingness to continue the legal and electoral dispute resolution training sessions, the electoral security and planning training, as well as the lessons learned workshops for the CCLC Board and the training sessions for elected councilors and council administrators. Through the engagement of CSOs, the project reached out to Libyan voters, male and female, activists, media professionals and academia. Although the project did not conduct perception surveys to assess the impact on large-scale beneficiaries, the post-training/workshop evaluation questionnaires from CSOs reported a high-level satisfaction from target groups. These included men, women, youth as first-time voters, civil society representatives and other stakeholders that attended various awareness raising activities.



*Content creation workshop, 13-17 November 2022.
Photo credit: ©UNDP Libya.*

Communications and publicity

UNDP systematically covered the conduct of local elections through posts on social media platforms. The project activities, such as workshops and training sessions were covered by UNDP social media platforms, while ensuring due visibility to the project donors and international partners. Some of the activities were reported by local news outlets, such as the consultation for reunification of Libyan institutions led by a high-level technical group under the auspices of the NPC and co-facilitated by UNDP and the United States Institute for Peace (USIP).

IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY REVIEW

(i) **Sustainability**

Sustainability of results was a constant priority for the project since its inception and was systematically integrated into the project strategy throughout its lifecycle. The project strengthened national capacities, developed and solidified partnerships to promote national ownership and capacities sustainability. Sustainability in electoral assistance projects is intrinsically linked to electoral processes being effectively organized by state institutions. Therefore, the sustainability of results and capacities built may be affected by the parameters beyond the project span and mandate, such as the stability of the legal and regulatory framework, observance of a regular and systematic electoral cycle, and timeliness of electoral operations, as well as political and institutional stability.

Based on the project context, the LEP invested in and further built on CCMCE's / CCLE's existing resources –people, skills, technologies– to ensure that designed interventions promote sustainable development. The advice and support to national institutions also considered the long-term development of electoral capacity and sustainability. Given the above, the LEP systematically transferred all outreach and sensitization materials developed by the project to the Committee for future use. In addition, the LEP produced and handed over technical documents on electoral operations, such as lessons learned, best practices, voting and procedures manuals, and other policy documents, in a collection of knowledge products.

Given the project's exit strategy, collaboration with national partners and electoral stakeholders was strengthened in 2022. The project formed new partnerships with the High Council of Judges and the State Lawsuits Cases Authority, the Electoral Security Department of the MoI (East and West branches), and the Training Centre of the MoLG. The project intensified partnerships with primary beneficiaries, such as municipal councils for 2022, with training sessions and workshops on community participation and consultative processes. Moreover, the project team also enhanced collaboration with the CCLE throughout the year following the establishment of task forces in 2021. The latter focused on four operational areas of electoral support, while in 2022, the project launched an additional task force on Operations with an oversight role. Its functions included coordination, prioritization of activities, and the oversight of activity implementation. Finally, the project connected local, international partners and NGOs, specifically in the work supporting communication and networking with municipal councils and other interested parties.

(ii) **Participatory processes**

The LEP applied a participatory approach in its programming since the beginning. The project designed its structure and organogram to mirror the structure of the CCMCE units to provide adequate support to the Committee. Consequently, project advisors collocated at the CCMCE / CCLE headquarters, except for the of the pandemic period, when they supported remotely, and planned activities in consultation with their counterparts. The participatory process was

reinforced in 2021, following the set-up of weekly task forces, and was further completed with the regular inclusion of CCMCE/CCLE Board members in the programming of activities.

In the second semester of 2022 and because of the project's closure, the LEP launched a series of consultations with the MoLG to discuss the new Local Governance Project and the scope of its activities. Specifically, consultative processes took place between the MoLG's Training Centre and the project's Municipal Council Support Team for the induction module delivery to all Libyan municipalities, whether already elected or to be elected in the future.

(iii) **Quality of partnerships**

The project invested substantial resources in the new partnerships formation with stakeholders besides CCMCE/CCLE, who have an essential role in electoral processes. This approach aimed at strengthening the support to national institutions and the relevance of electoral assistance interventions with respect to development goals. The team formed new partnerships with the High Council of Judges, the State Lawsuits Cases Authority, the Electoral Security Department of the MoI, the NPC and the Supreme Council of Local Administration. Similarly, the project continued to work with elected municipal councils and civil society organizations on awareness raising activities for local democratic processes and participatory governance. This partnership was further extended to several municipal councils pending to be elected having little to no international support.

(iv) **National ownership**

The project outputs were agreed with the CCMCE in line with UN efforts to build the capacity of Libya's transitional governance structures and facilitate citizens' participation in democratic processes. Initially, the needs expressed by the CCMCE corresponded to essential services provided traditionally by UNDP electoral assistance projects. Through its basket fund, the LEP procured electoral materials, provided technical expertise on operations, including voter registration, civic and voter education, and electoral security. Institutional capacity building was also embedded under the first output and funded by the project. Following a discussion with the CCMCE on the ways to strengthen and promote local democracy, an additional component to support the newly elected municipal councils was designed. Subsequently, the Post-Election Initiative (PEI) was added to the project document as a democracy bonus under the second output, which later developed as the Municipal Council Support component. Newly elected councils would receive support to strengthen their communication and outreach capacities, thus increasing citizen's trust in their administration. In turn, citizen's trust would potentially generate broader interest in municipal council affairs and, eventually, contribute to higher participation rates in local elections.

Another example of joint decision-making with a national counterpart was the reunification of the Libyan institutions' component. In late 2021, following consultations with the NPC, the reunification of Libyan institutions was created as an additional component under the project's second output. The NPC, the LEP/UNDP, and the United States Institute for Peace (USIP) co-led and facilitated technical consultations with institutions from Eastern and Western-backed

governments of Libya. Regarding collaboration with the CCMCE (later CCLE), the project sponsored national advisors embedded in the Committee. The advisors provided services in the areas of data management, training and procedures, and translation. The project did not have joint monitoring, evaluation, or reporting with the CCMCE/CCLE.

(v) **Monitoring and evaluation**

The project did not develop a robust monitoring plan during its lifecycle due to the limitations within the M&E dedicated resources and expertise deficiency. Although the LEP regularly tracked its activities plan, both through meetings with the CCMCE/CCLE and internally, this did not compensate for the lack of a robust monitoring and evaluation framework. The corrective action undertaken by the project to remedy this situation was to weekly review the activity plans by the task forces throughout 2021. That was later reinforced by the set-up of the Operations task force in 2022, which had an oversight role over the other task forces. Another factor which prevented monitoring project results was that the monitoring activity remained confined within the project boundaries and was extended as a required joint activity to project donors at the technical level. It is safe to assume that having technical inputs and directions with respect to objectives and intended results would have helped the monitoring and evaluation framework of the project. The project improved data collection in 2021 and 2022 but these processes lacked systemic organization and were not fully integrated into the M&E framework and overall project. Despite these challenges, monitoring of plans was constant, with the LEP evaluating and reviewing workshops, training sessions and other activities, particularly in 2022. For to the activities implemented by CSOs, reporting was done in line with UNDP requirements. However, impact results monitoring and evaluation was weak due to lack of performance indicators and measurement tools to assess impact. In 2022, the project commissioned an external evaluation team, which conducted the final evaluation of the LEP.

(vi) **Timely delivery of outputs**

The project Board extended the LEP two times consecutively, first in May 2019 and later in June 2021. These extensions were granted to ensure continued support to the CCMCE (later CCLE) in supporting the organization of remaining second-generation council elections and the implementation of the of third-generation council elections.

The outputs of the annual work plan were not delivered following a strict schedule, primarily because the LEP's planning capacity was affected by and dependent on CCMCE's / CCLE's planning and decision-making capacity, along with the availability of government funding. Altogether, the factors inhibiting the timely delivery of outputs as per the annual work plan were internal organizational delays due to weak administrative support in conjunction with delays and changes in CCMCE's / CCLE's decisions and strategy, the outbreak of COVID-19, the lack of a stable electoral calendar, the deterioration of the security situation in Libya and the existence of residual tensions in a number of municipalities, primarily in the South-East and Western regions, inability to conduct elections in the East due to the political division between the East and the West, changes in the electoral legal framework and regulation coupled with suspensions of the legal framework in the course of the project, lack of government

funding to the CCMCE (later CCLE) and significant delays in the disbursement of the electoral budget, the lack of political will and engagement, and the negative impact of the political division affecting the completion of municipal council elections across Libya.

(vii) **Cost-effective use of inputs**

The project used its resources to the broadest possible extent in the interest of ensuring cost-effective programming. One example is the employment of two of the advisors recruited for the civic and voter education component to support the work of the Municipal Council team and assist in several capacity development training sessions for municipal councils.

IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES

#	Description	Date Identified	Type	Impact & Priority	Countermeasures / Management response	Owner	Submitted/ updated by	Last Update	Status
1	Instability of legal framework for local elections	2018	Problem; strategic, operational	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Delays in organization of local elections I:5 & P:5 -Suspension of local elections I:5 & P:5 -Invalidation of electoral regulation for local elections I:5 & P:5 -Increase of public distrust in local elections and Electoral committee I:5 & P:5 -Voter apathy and lack of interest in local elections I:5 & P:5 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Continuous monitoring of developments and advocacy on importance of stable legal framework with CCMCE/CCLE -Organization of large stakeholder meeting in 2019 to review changes of regulation -Recruitment of international legal electoral advisor to support CCMCE legal unit -Recruitment of national legal electoral advisor and production of draft electoral law 	CTA, Chief of Operations	Project officer	2022	Resolved
2	Deterioration of security situation in Western and Southern Libya	2018 & 2019	Problem; security, operational, strategic	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Inability to conduct local elections in Western and Southern Libya I:5, P:5 -Inability and delay in delivering project activities related to electoral 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Continuous monitoring of security situation by Project team -Conduct of conflict and security assessments in 	CTA, Field coordination advisor	Project officer	2022	Resolved

				assistance (Output 1) and civic and voter education (Output 2) I:4, P:4	municipalities targeted for elections -Field coordination project advisor strengthens communication with Ministry of Interior's Electoral Security Department				
3	Changes in leadership of CCMCE	2021	Problem; Operational, strategic	-Delay in organization of local elections and delay in implementation of project activities I:4 P:5	-Daily interaction with CCMCE/CCLE at senior management and Board level -Set-up of Operations task force and weekly meetings between CCLE and LEP counterparts -LEP organized retreat for CCLE Board to strengthen capacities and organizational coherence	CTA, Chief of Operations	Project officer	2022	Resolved
4	Volatile planning of local elections and uncertainty of electoral calendar	2020	Problem; Operational, strategic	-Delay in organization of local elections I:5 P:5 -Delay or cancellation of certain activities implemented by CSOs I:5 P:5	-Continuous provision of advice to CCMCE/CCLE on need to establish steady timeline for elections -Project organizes workshop on	CTA, Chief of Operations	Project officer	2022	Resolved

				-Project delivery capacity weakened and delays accumulated I:5 P:5	Operational plan for CCLE Board -No-cost extensions to some CSOs granted				
5	Internal delays in implementation of project activities due to limited administrative capacity	2021	Problem; organizational, operational	-Administrative constraints for timely completion of procedures	-Recruitment of second administrative assistant -Transfer of two national advisors to support project administration	CTA			Resolved

LESSONS LEARNED

One of the major lessons learned was the need to reduce the gap between corporate requirements on the one hand, and actual project results on the other. To address this gap, several sessions were held with the CCMCE on the joint planning and implementation. Noticeably, the common understanding of the results framework was not operationalized. As a transferrable lesson, this could be manifested in further projects and activities through incorporating a comprehensive monitoring plan from the design phase on, dedicating M&E expertise and resources on different stages of implementation and following through on the measurement tools and performance indicators for accessing impact.

Moreover, for a project such as the LEP, which was implemented in close collaboration with a national counterpart, the development of a joint results framework would have probably been the solution. Developing the joint logical framework, that was regularly reviewed and assessed against progress with realistic targets and indicators as well as milestones, would, of course, require time and resources, which were not always available on both sides. Additionally, there was a need to associate project donors at the technical level to the monitoring and evaluation exercises. That is something which was not done.

Finally, in the context of an electoral assistance project with an advisory function to an independent electoral management body, there is a need to have a mutually acceptable framework of collaboration for the advisory services. While fully respecting the principle of national ownership, local context and sensitivities, best practices for elections which are recognized by international standards should be taken into account by the national counterpart.

RECOMMENDATIONS

In the context of the LEP, a project team creation with versatile and practical skills was a positive element that supported the achievement of project outputs, and as such it is retained as a recommendation for the next phase of the project. However, multitasking often proved detrimental to the project's productivity and corporate obligations. As the LEP transitions into the new Local Governance Project, a means to ensure business continuity in local elections and local governance can be done by taking stock of the experience accumulated by the LEP project team in the context of the new project.

In addition, continue to provide electoral assistance and support to municipal councils through a team of national advisors and through a chief technical advisor in the context of the integrated UN electoral assistance services. That will help provide quality electoral advice in conjunction with the some international experts recruitment to support local governance and municipal councils. Furthermore, it is recommended to continue supporting the CCLE with hands-on assistance by collocating national staff in the committee and within the different units as done with the CCMCE. To improve project implementation, it is recommended to recruit an Operations advisor or manager with an oversight role on activity implementation.

With respect to the MCS component, it is recommended to continue the direct engagement with the municipal councils and core administration and expand the community participation module to all newly elected councils. In addition, develop new training modules in collaboration with the UNDP pillars of Climate & Energy and Peace & Resilience.

Regarding the component ‘Reunification of Libyan institutions,’ it is recommended to continue the work with the NPC as a national partner and USIP as an international partner for the reasons as follows: (1) the reunification process has had several symbolic successes which have been essential in reinforcing and reassuring at the national and international level the importance and relevance of Libya’s unity; (2) UNDP with governance in its signature solutions is very well placed to assist the NPC and relevant entities in the reunification process and enhance and increase its reputation as a core actor in the governance sector; (3) USIP is a critical actor among the US-funded organizations, as it advises Congress on funding to US agencies and beyond; therefore, USIP is a strategic partner in the reunification process, and UNDP could capitalize on this partnership.

FINANCIAL STATUS AND UTILIZATION

Initially, the project was resourced with funding from Germany worth US\$2,357,500, the Government of Libya worth US\$1,233,734 and the United Kingdom worth US\$ 1,099,227,18. Financial utilization at the end of 2018 reached US\$588,453 with delivery at 12.5% of the available budget. In 2019, two more contributions were added to the project basket fund, namely from France with the amount of € 314,500 disbursed in two tranches and Italy with the amount of € 862,500. In the end of 2019, the project had spent US\$1,803,060.65 with delivery at 34.2% of the available budget. In 2020, the project received the second tranche of the French funding, namely €138,500 and had spent by the end of the year US\$ 2,793,991.76 with delivery at 77.3% of the available budget. In the third quarter of 2021, the project received funding from the European Union through the Stability, Unity and Social Cohesion (SUSC) integrated project of UNDP, which was earmarked for peace building and outreach activities. The contribution was worth USD 1,240,455.28 for SUSC-LEP component and USD 649,296.82 for project management of SUSC-LEP component. Funds utilization for SUSC-LEP component is managed and reported under SUSC project. In the fourth quarter of 2021, Germany made an additional contribution to the project worth US\$ 2.9 million and in November, the Czech Republic became the newest project donor with a contribution of US\$72,000. Financial utilization in 2021, reached \$1,871,858.48 with delivery at 49.3% of the available budget. In 2022, there was no new contributions to the basket fund and the project spent US\$ 1,441,676.06, with delivery at 75.1% of the available funds.

ANNEXES

ANNEX I: FINANCIAL SUMMARY

a) Donors contribution and funds utilization under LEP Project (00110614)

Donors	Funds Received	Funds Utilization	Balance funds
		provisional	
	in USD		
Germany	5,225,338.31	4,964,453.93	260,884.38
Govt of Libya	1,233,732.90	1,233,732.90	-
United Kingdom	1,099,227.18	1,099,227.18	-
Italy	948,844.88	948,844.88	-
France	355,808.01	355,808.01	-
Czech Republic	64,665.95	64,665.95	-
Total	8,927,617.23	8,666,732.85	260,884.38

b) Project funds utilization

Projet outputs	Expenditure (provisional)					Grand Total
	Year					
	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	
Output 1: Support to the planning and implementation of credible election operations including voter registration	401,633.15	1,027,034.44	1,139,705.85	322,080.84	447,418	3,337,872
Output 2: Facilitation of democratic participation before and in between elections through voter and civic education, awareness raising activities	4,353.08	299,527.57	981,398.13	631,114.47	672,963.91	2,589,357.16
Project Management	163,189.85	365,891.52	502,800.56	674,805.83	342,284.81	2,048,972.57
General Management Service (GMS)	19,277.01	110,076.12	152,850.51	143,753.54	99,567.02	525,524.20
Direct Project Costs	0	531	17,236.71	100,103.80	47,135.13	165,006.64
Total	588,453.09	1,803,060.65	2,793,991.76	1,871,858.48	1,609,368.87	8,666,732.85

* Balance funds, comprising USD 260,884.38, are planned to be utilized for settlement of project obligations during the financial closure period of LEP project in 2023. As agreed with the Government of Germany, the unspent funds will be transferred to the Local Governance Project (LGP), the next generation project of LEP.

ANNEX II: LIST OF CSOs SUPPORTED THROUGH LOW-VALUE GRANTS (LVG)

#	Name of partner CSO	Municipalities covered by CSOs	LVG (2019)	LVG (2020)	LVG (2021)	LVG (2022)
1	Momken	Regdaleen, Kikla	Call 1	-	-	-
2	Atta Al Khair	Sharqia, Brak A- Shati, Gurda A- Shati, Edri Shati, Wadi Etba, Obari	Call 1	-	-	-
3	Jabal Nafousa	A-Rahibat, Wazen, Nalut, Qalaa	Call 1	-	-	-
4	South Peace Organization for Development	Obari, Al Ghrefa, Bent Baya, Wadi Etba, Al Bwanees	Call 1	-	-	-
5	H2O	Zawia South, Misallata, Misrata Sharqia, Ghat, Kikla, Qatron, Traghen, Haraba, Al Khoms, Gaser Al Akhiyar, Jadu, Kabaw, Sabrata, Surman, Zliten, Hay Al- Andalus, Swani Ben Adam, Tajura, Garabulli, Tripoli Centre, Souq Al Jumua	Call 1	Call 3	Call 4	-
6	Al Mizan	Misrata, Haraba, Al Khoms, Zawiya South, Gaser Al Akhiyar, Jadu, Kabaw, Misallata, Sabrata, Surman, Zliten, Al Bayda, Shaht, Benghazi, Derna, Sirt, Al Jufra, Harawah, Kalij A- Sidra	-	Call 3	Call 4	Call 5
7	Women's Forum for Development	Haraba, Al Khoms, Zawia South, Gaser Al Akhiyar, Jadu, Kabaw, Misallata, Sabrata, Surman, Zliten, Yefren, Gharyan, Zawia, Abu Salim, Ain Zara, Janzur, Qasr Bin Ghashir	-	Call 3	-	Call 5

8	Nana Marin	Haraba, Al Khoms, Zawia South, Gaser Al Akhiyar, Jadu, Kabaw, Misallata, Sabrata, Surman, Zliten, Hay Al Andalus, Swani Ben Adam, Tajura, Garabulli, Tripoli Centre, Souq Al Jumua	-	Call 3	Call 4	-
9	Hexa Connection	Nation-wide with a focus on Zintan, Benghazi, Al Bayda Souq Al Jumua	-	-	Call 4	-
10	Libya Film Institute	Nation-wide with a focus on Tripoli Centre, Tajura, Souq Al Jumua	-	-	Call 4	-
11	Fonoon	Misrata, Yefren, Gharyan, Zawia, Abu Salim, Ain Zara, Janzur, Qasr Bin Gashir & nation-wide social media campaign	-	Call 3	Call 4	Call 5
12	Al Montahaa	Haraba, Al Khoms, Zawia South, Gaser Al Akhiyar, Jadu, Kabaw, Misallata, Sabrata, Surman, Zliten	-	Call 3	-	-
13	Partnership for Bani Waleed	Bani Waleed, Tarhouna	-	-	-	Call 5
Total municipalities supported			53			

ANNEX III: LIST OF SUPPORTED MUNICIPAL COUNCIL ELECTIONS

#	Municipality	Date	Status	Region	Voter registration	Total voted	Voter turnout				
1	Derj	15/09/2018	Held /CCMCE	West	T: 4.398	39.8%	M: 73.4%	F: 26.6%			
					M: 2.459				1.753	1.287	466
					F: 1.939						
2	Zawia	12/05/2018	Held /CCMCE	West	T: 19.227	62.31%	M:74%	F :26%			
					M: 13.459				11.981	8.866	3.115
					F: 5.768						
3	Bani Waleed	15/09/2018	Held /CCMCE	West	T: 22.787	31.6%	M:	F: 19.19%			
					M: 2.428				7.203	80.81%	1.382
					F: 1.580						
4	Wadi Etba	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 7.536	53.18%	M: 60.5%	F: 39.5%			
					M: 3.945				4.008	2.428	1.580
					F: 3.591						
5	Bent Beya	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 9.595	53.84%	M: 61%	F: 39%			
					M: 5.117				5.166	3.151	2.015
					F: 4.478						
6	Zuwara	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	West	T: 11.024	29.68%	M: 70%	F: 30%			
					M: 6.547				3.273	2.288	985
					F: 4.477						
7	Baten Al Jabal	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	West	T: 12.619	35.89%	M: 72%	F: 28%			
					M: 6.887				4.530	3.269	1.261
					F: 5.732						
8	Al Qala	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 6.522	33.16%	M: 68%	F: 22%			
					M: 3.514				2.165	1.473	692
					F: 3.008						
9	Al Riyayna	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 7.584	32.71%	M: 70%	F: 30%			

					M: 4.275 F: 3.309	2.481	1.753	728
10	Nalut	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 5.673 M: 3.391 F: 2.282	34.44% 1.954	M: 76.6% 1.498	F: 23.6% 456
11	Al Hawamed	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 3.311 M: 1.957 F: 1.354	49% 1.624	M: 70.8% 1.150	F: 29.2% 474
12	Ghadames	30/03/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 4.660 M: 2.249 F: 2.214	24.65% 1.149	M: 67% 773	F: 33% 376
13	Nesma	-	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 2.944 M: 1.688 F: 1.256	One list No election	NA	NA
14	Wazen	06/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 2.764 M: 1.518 F: 1.246	45.44% 1.256	M: 65% 820	F: 35% 436
15	Al Bwanees	06/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 3.536 M: 2.145 F: 1.391	44.4% 1.570	M: 67% 1.055	F: 33% 515
16	Regdaleen	06/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	West	T: 9.893 M: 6.378 F: 3.515	36.4% 3.602	M: 78.5% 2.829	F: 21.5% 773
17	Al Ghrefa	06/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 9.122 M: 5.229 F: 3.893	50.64% 4.620	M: 63% 2.907	F: 37% 1.713
18	Brak A-Shati	20/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 9.948 M: 6.067 F: 3.881	37.59% 3.740	M: 76% 2.837	F: 24% 1.242
19	Edri A-Shati	20/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 13.469	41.68%	M: 64.4%	F: 35.6%

					M: 7.486 F: 6.208	5.615	3.628	1.987
20	Obari	20/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 6.736 M: 3.975 F: 2.869	38% 2.561	M:61% 1.558	F: 39% 975
21	A-Rihabat	20/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 4.712 M: 3.023 F: 1.689	27.65% 1.303	M: 79% 1.033	F: 21% 287
22	Zilten	20/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	West	T: 8.336 M: 4.432 F: 3.905	51% 4.255	M:60% 2.568	F :40% 1.601
23	Gurda A-Shati	20/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 15.004 M: 8.599 F: 6.405	40.6% 6.093	M: 72% 4.402	F: 28% 2.218
24	A-Shweref	20/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	Southwest	T: 2.599 M: 1.350 F: 1.249	64% 1.664	M:55% 915	F: 45% 749
25	Sabha	27/04/2019	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 27.364 M: 16.976 F: 10.388	28.64% 7.838	M: 71.5% 5.604	F: 28.5% 2.234
26	Ghat	18/08/2020	Held /CCMCE	South	T: 11.358 M: 6.027 F: 5.331	54% 6.103	M: 59% 3.394	F: 41% 2.709
27	Kikla	25/08/2020	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 7.304 M: 4.091 F: 3.213	44% 1.941	M: 56% 1.396	F: 44% 545
28	Misrata	03/09/2020	Held /CCMCE	West	98379 M: 58.456 F: 39.923	28% 28.159	M: 75% 21.362	F: 25% 6.797

29	Al Haraba	15/10/2020	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 6.540	44%	M: 68%	F: 32%			
					M: 3.652				2.879	1.957	922
					F: 2.828						
30	Jadu	15/10/2020	Held /CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 7.265	32%	M: 75%	F: 25%			
					M: 4.443				2.324	1.743	581
					F: 2.822						
31	Kabaw	15/10/2020	Held / CCMCE	West	T: 8119	34%	M: 69%	F: 31%			
					M: 4.353				2.800	1.932	868
					F: 3.766						
32	Zawia South	15/10/2020	Held / CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 9.936	34%	M: 72%	F: 28%			
					M: 5.724				3.460	2.492	968
					F: 4.212						
33	Zawia West	21/12/2020	Held / CCMCE	Nafusa (West)	T: 2.3114	32%	M: 76%	F: 24%			
					M: 14.149				7.625	5.802	1.823
					F: 8.965						
34	Al Rujban	21/12/2020	Held / CCMCE	West	T: 6.761	27%	M: 72%	F: 28%			
					M: 3.847				1.802	1.295	507
					F: 2.914						
35	Hay Al Andalus	07/01/2021	Held / CCMCE Cancelled, to be reconducted	West	T: 35.040	22%	M: 73%	F: 27%			
					M: 22.478				8.074	5.894	2.180
					F: 12.562						
36	Gaser Al Akhiar	07/01/2021	Held / CCMCE	West	T: 10.404	35%	M: 80%	F: 20%			
					M: 7.971				3.685	2.948	737
					F: 2.433						
37	Swani Bin Adam	07/01/2021 23/01/2021	Held / CCMCE Re-run (02 polling centres)	West	T: 17.234	41%	M: 69%	F: 31%			
					M: 11.263				6.922	4.777	2.145
					F: 5.971						
38	Zlitin	07/01/2021	Held / CCMCE	West	T: 48.610	42%	M: 82%	F: 18%			
					M: 35.703				20.521	16.828	3.693

					F:12.907			
39	Tajoura	16/01/2021	Held / CCMCE Cancelled, reinstated	West	T: 2.4274	25%	M: 79%	F: 21%
					M: 15.990	6.451	5.097	1.354
					F: 8.284			
40	Sabratah	16/01/2021	Held / CCMCE	West	24.540	28%	M: 73%	F: 27%
					M:15.380	6.942	5.068	1.874
					F: 9.160			
41	Garabouli	23/01/2021	Held / CCMCE	West	T: 13.625	43%	M: 80%	F: 20%
					M: 9.703	6.054	4.844	1.210
					F: 3.922			
42	Tripoli Centre	06/02/2021	Held / CCMCE	West	T: 33.740	19%	M: 72%	F: 28%
					M: 20.435	6.524	4.697	1.827
					F: 13.305			
43	Souq Al Jumu'a	03/04/2021 05/06/2021	Held / CCMCE Re-run (04 polling centres)	West	T: 47.164	19%	M: 80%	F: 20%
					M: 28.787	9.455	7.611	1.844
					F:18.377			
44	Tarhuna	22/10/2022	Held / CCLE	West	T: 25.453	41%	M: 81.6%	F: 18.4%
					M: 18.837	10.527	8.591	1.748
					F: 6.616			
45	Al Khums	07/01/2023	Held / CCLE	West	T: 19.136	71.5%	M: 81%	F: 19%
					M: 14.921	13.696	11.095	2.601
					F: 4.215			
46	Gharyan	04/02/2023	Held / CCLE	West	T: 8.879	67.6%	M: 86%	F: 14%
					M: 7.328	6.008	5.167	841
					F: 1.551			
47	Al Orban	11/02/2023	Held / CCLE	Southwest	T: 4.623	75.8%	M: 69%	F: 31%
					M: 3.049	3.504	2.418	1.086
					F: 1.574			
48	Al Mardoum	25/02/2023	Held / CCLE	West	T: 1.239	72.9%	M: 69%	F: 31%

					M: 773 F: 466	903	623	280
49	Tininai	25/02/2023	Held / CCLE	West	T: 1.533 M: 929 F: 604	67.5% 1.035	M: 65% 673	F: 35% 362
50	Bani Waleed	25/02/2023	Held / CCLE	West	T: 17.304 M: 12.062 F: 5.242	68.7% 11.899	M: 71% 8.448	F: 29% 3.451